

Justification of Selection – Sample Report

(Date)

TO: Office of Equal Opportunity, Access and Title IX Coordination
SIUE, Box 1025, Edwardsville, Illinois 62026-1025 Fax: 618-650-2270

FROM: John Smith, Department Head, Department of Music

SUBJECT: Administrative Support Supervisor Posting No. FY 14-01

Hiring Decision and Start Date	I am writing to inform you that we have completed the recruitment process for the position of Administrative Support Supervisor. The Selection Committee has decided that Marion Brown is the best qualified candidate for the position. Ms. Brown is required to give two weeks notice to her current department, so we are expecting a possible start date for her of June 30, 2014.
Search Committee	The selection committee included me as Chair, Dr. Candice Johns a faculty member in the department, and Ms. Shirley Day the executive assistant in the faculty office. Based on the criteria posted as Qualifications for the position, all committee members reviewed and evaluated the application materials, developed interview questions, and selected candidates for interview.
Criteria Specify job requirements and preferred assets of applicants.	<p>The criteria included:</p> <p>Requirements</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • University degree in a related study area. • One year of related office experience. • Demonstrated experience with budgetary and general office operating procedures. • Proficiency in Window's 95/Corel8/WordPerfect, Paradox and related software. • Ability to work independently with a minimum of supervision and to supervise the day-to-day operation of an office. • Good interpersonal skills and the ability to maintain confidentiality and deal with crisis situations in an appropriate manner. • Must exercise tact, good judgment and sensitivity both in-person and on the telephone. • Professional appearance. • Legible handwriting. <p>Assets</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Experience within a university setting. • Knowledge of various A/V equipment.
Applicant Pool Internal / External	Ten applications were received: three internal applicants and seven externals. The three internal applicants and two externals were selected for interview. At the time of arranging the interviews, each candidate was informed of the members of the Search Committee, the expected duration of the interview, and that a work simulation of computer skills would follow the interview. Two applicants declined an interview, both stating that they had taken other new positions.
Search Process	The interviews were followed by a committee meeting where discussion took place on each candidate's response to the interview questions, the work simulation rankings, and reference information. Each committee member calculated summary rating scores which clearly established that Ms. Marion Brown had a significantly higher score. All committee members indicated that they were in unanimous agreement with the evidence that Ms. Brown was demonstrably the best qualified candidate.

<p>Justification Include the name, race and gender of the successful applicant, why he or she was selected over other qualified applicants, particularly where women and/or minorities were finalists but not selected for the position.</p>	<p>Following is a summary of the search committee's evaluation of the final candidates.</p> <p>Marion Brown Ms. Brown's education includes B.A. degree in a related study area, a requirement for this position. Her experience includes office administration experience comparable to the office management experience required in the vacancy. Ms. Brown also has related experience with university office forms and student programs. She has extensive direct experience with the computer software currently in use in the department with which the budget is administered. She placed highest of all the applicants who performed the work simulation, computer exercises to analyze candidates' proficiencies in Window's '95 and WordPerfect. In her background as an assistant to academic administrators, she has worked with five Associate Deans. This experience is relevant to the vacancy in that the incumbent works closely with the Department Head in organizing the work of the unit and coordinating the department budgets. Ms. Brown has experience supervising other office support staff. As well, the position requires that the incumbent work closely with the Department Head in ensuring the smooth operation of the department as a service provider. A review of Ms. Brown's work history with the University shows an individual who has worked in progressively responsible positions that have given her the opportunity to acquire higher levels of responsibility.</p> <p>In addition, from her answers at the interview and from references provided, Ms. Brown has demonstrated excellent interpersonal skills, initiative, and good judgment. She was well prepared for the interview, gave thoughtful responses to the questions, and showed a keen interest in the position. Finally Ms. Brown was evaluated in an extremely positive manner in regard to her past work experience based on the reference materials provided by the candidate and phone contacts with previous supervisors.</p> <p>Ms. Brown is a African American Female</p> <p>Jody Foster Ms. Foster does not have a university degree, or an equivalent combination of education and experience. Ms. Foster has office experience of a general secretarial/clerical nature. Her experience in planning, maintaining and administering a university operating budget is limited to that of substituting for her office supervisor when the supervisor was away on vacation. She has no supervisory experience of other office support staff. She has no experience working with the computer software our department uses to monitor and report on its budget. Of the candidates who performed the work simulation, Ms. Foster ranked second. A review of her work history with the University shows that Ms. Foster has worked exclusively in secretarial positions at the Office Support Assistant level which have not provided her with the opportunity to experience higher levels of responsibility. In many instances Ms. Foster did not answer the interview questions as asked. For example, questions asking for specific examples of events or accomplishments were answered in general terms.</p> <p>Finally Ms. Foster was evaluated in a positive manner in regard to her past work experience based on the reference materials provided by her. She had requested, however, that her current supervisor not be contacted. We contacted her past office supervisor about Ms. Foster's performance. He reported that she was a hard worker and that there were no formal complaints lodged regarding her.</p> <p>Ms. Foster is a White Female</p>
--	--

	<p>Linda Wesley</p> <p>Ms. Wesley has a B.A. degree in a related study area. Ms. Wesley's experience is primarily of a technical nature. At the interview she stated that approximately 60% of her current job is technical. Although there is an office assistant component in her current job, it is clerical and somewhat limited. For example, duties in her current position include monitoring a grant (\$50,000). She has no experience participating in preparing operating budget submissions, capital expenditure submissions, arranging budget transfers, or using computer software to keep financial records. She stated she would require training to use our department's budget software. She has taken two courses on Windows 95, however, has not had an opportunity to work in the system. Of the candidates who performed the work simulation, Ms. Wesley ranked third. She has no Paradox experience. She has no supervisory experience of other office support staff. Her office management experience is limited in that her work environment includes herself and the director she works for. Her experience working with students is limited to students being paid through the grant for research duties.</p> <p>Ms. Wesley had difficulty in answering some of the questions and stated she felt "overwhelmed". However, she presented herself very well at the interview. Her strengths lie in her good interpersonal skills. Based on the reference materials provided by the candidate, Ms. Wesley was evaluated in a positive manner in regards to her work experience and in a highly positive manner as to her "people" skills. Follow-up contact with a past supervisor was also very positive about her interpersonal and time management skills.</p> <p>Ms. Wesley is a African American Female</p>
<p>Summary</p>	<p>To summarize: During the interviews each member of the committee rated the candidates' responses to the questions. Following the interviews each member added up the ratings they had assigned. The committee's summary scores are as follows (out of a possible 4000 points): Marion Brown - 3525; Jody Foster – 2410; Linda Wesley – 2250. Based on this information, rankings on the work simulations, information on academic/training credentials and references, the committee unanimously judged Ms. Brown as demonstrably the best candidate to fulfill the requirements of the position.</p> <p>Enclosed are copies of the selection criteria and evaluation tools used to assess applicant job qualifications and determine the finalists for the position. I look forward to hearing from you.</p> <p>cc: Human Resources</p> <p>Dean's Office</p>